

## Building quantitative value models based on qualitative value judgements: The MACBETH approach, software and applications

## **Course Topics:**

- 1. Problem Structurating and Framing
  - 1.1. Identifying Policy Units and Framing their Spatial Relationships
  - 1.2. Scoping Participation (From Structuring to Evaluation)
  - 1.3. Facts (objective aspects) & Values (subjective aspects)
  - 1.4. Socio-technical constructive/participatory process design (decision conferences, requisite models, process consultation)
- 2. Criteria Tree
  - 2.1. Disentangling, Means/Ends and Causes/Effects Objectives
  - 2.2. Compensatory Models
    - 2.2.1.Desired Properties
  - 2.3. Synergies/Antagonisms
  - 2.4. Screening
- 3. Structuring Policy Instruments / Policy Mix
  - 3.1. Structuring/Combining Policy Instruments into a Policy Mix (e.g. AIDA)
  - 3.2. Baseline (business as usual)
    - 3.2.1.With
    - 3.2.2.Without
  - 3.3. Additivity
- 4. Performance measurement (Indicators/Descriptors) for each policy instrument/mix
  - 4.1. Means/Ends & Causes/Effects
  - 4.2.With
    - 4.2.1. Desired Properties
    - 4.2.2.Typology of Indicators (quantitative/qualitative, natural/constructed, direct/indirect, discrete/continuous)
    - 4.2.3.Spatial (e.g.: derived from before-after-control-intervention or quasi-experimental "impact evaluation" methods)
      - 4.2.3.1. Resolution
      - 4.2.3.2. Inter-spatial tradeoffs
    - 4.2.4.Non-Spatial
    - 4.2.5.Inter-temporal tradeoffs
    - 4.2.6. Screening
  - 4.3. Without (→ see 5.2.2)
- 5. Evaluation/Tradeoffs (MACBETH)
  - 5.1. Reference performance levels of intrinsic value
    - 5.1.1.OPTIMAL (e.g.: derived from outputs of optimal reserve site selection)
    - 5.1.2.GOOD (Targets and aspiration levels)
    - 5.1.3. NEUTRAL (Minimal satisfactory levels)

- 5.2. Scoring (Intra-criteria value judgments)
  - 5.2.1.Indirect value scoring
    - 5.2.1.1. Quantitative Value/Utility Functions
    - 5.2.1.2. Qualitative
  - 5.2.2. Direct value scoring (direct paired comparisons)
  - 5.2.3. Screening
- 5.3. Weights (Inter-criteria tradeoff judgments)
  - 5.3.1.Screening
  - 5.3.2.Scales
- 5.4. Overall scoring
- 6. Sensitivity and robustness Analysis (MACBETH)
  - 6.1. Uncertainty, imprecision or bad determination of performances
  - 6.2. Uncertainty on value judgments
- 7. Negotiation/Conflict Analysis
- 8. Resource Allocation (commons dilemma)